

**JOINT HEALTH OVERVIEW AND SCRUTINY COMMITTEE  
(YORKSHIRE & THE HUMBER)**

**TUESDAY, 25TH NOVEMBER, 2014**

**PRESENT:** Councillor D Coupar in the Chair

Councillors M James, L Smaje and K Wyatt

Apologies Councillor J Bromby, D Brown, J Clark,  
C Funnell, V Greenwood, B Hall,  
J Hyldon-King, T Revill,  
B Rhodes, M Rooney and  
H Spence

**21 Chair's Opening Remarks**

The Chair opened the meeting, welcomed all those present and thanked them for their attendance.

The Chair highlighted the 'Third Party Recordings' code of practice that applied to the meeting in relation to the use of recorded information at the meeting.

Introductions were given and the Chair acknowledged the low numbers of Committee members present, primarily due to the number of meetings held in a short period of time and the relatively short notice provided in confirming the availability of the information presented at the meeting.

**22 Late Items**

The following supplementary information was received in relation to Item 6: NHS England's Review of Children's Heart Surgery Services at Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust:

- Submission from Children's Heart Surgery Fund (CHSF), Leeds

**23 Declaration of Disclosable Pecuniary Interests**

There were no declarations of disclosable pecuniary interests identified at the meeting.

**24 Apologies for Absence and Notification of Substitutes**

Apologies for absence were received as follows:

- Councillor J Bromby – North Lincolnshire Council
- Councillor D Brown – Hull City Council
- Councillor J Clark – North Yorkshire County Council
- Councillor C Funnell – City of York Council

- Councillor V Greenwood – Bradford Metropolitan District Council
- Councillor B Hall – East Riding of Yorkshire Council
- Councillor J Hyldon-King – North East Lincolnshire Council
- Councillor T Revill – Doncaster Metropolitan Borough Council
- Councillor B Rhodes – Wakefield Council
- Councillor M Rooney – Sheffield City Council
- Councillor H Spence – Barnsley Metropolitan Borough Council

In addition, apologies for absence were received from Councillor P Doughty (City of York Council), who had been due to attend as a substitute member on behalf of Councillor C Funnell.

It was also noted that, while not a member of the Joint Committee, apologies for absence had also been received from Stuart Andrew MP, who had been due to attend the meeting.

No substitute members were in attendance, however Cllr Tony Richardson (City of York Council) was in attendance as an observer.

## **25 NHS England's Review of Children's Heart Surgery Services at Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust**

The Joint Committee received and considered a report from the Head of Scrutiny and Member Development (Leeds City Council) that introduced additional information associated with NHS England's Review of Children's Heart Surgery Services at Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust. The following information was appended to the report:

- Independent review of concerns about paediatric cardiac surgery (the 14 cases) at Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust (Verita: October 2014)
- Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust – Overarching report about paediatric cardiac surgery (Verita: October 2014)

The following representatives were in attendance during consideration of this item:

- Mike Berwick – Deputy Medical Director, NHS England
- Dr Damian Riley – Medical Director, NHS England (North)
- Lucy Scott-Moncreiff – Senior Associate, Verita
- Barry Morris – Partner, Verita
- Dr Bryan Gill – Medical Director (Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust)
- Dr Elspeth Brown – Consultant Cardiologist (Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust)
- Councillor Lisa Mulherin – Executive Member for Health and Wellbeing, Leeds City Council

The Principal Scrutiny Adviser (Leeds City Council) introduced the item and provided an overview of the background provided in the report.

The Chair invited NHS England and Verita representatives to address the Joint Committee and summarise the independent review reports presented in the agenda papers.

The Deputy Medical Director (NHS England) provided a summary of events from March 2013, including the range of concerns raised at that time, that led to the commissioning of independent reviews and publication of the independent reports presented to the Joint Committee.

The Senior Associate (Verita) outlined the review process behind each report presented and highlighted the following key findings/ outcomes from the review:

- There had been a breakdown in trust between some hospitals.
- There had been a breakdown in trust between some parents and some clinicians.
- Improvements had been identified in aspects of Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust's record keeping and communication processes.

The Chair invited representatives from Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust (LTHT) to address the Joint Committee. A number of points were raised, including:

- The services at the Trust are safe and delivering high quality standards of care.
- Serious allegations had been made in March 2013 and, following rigorous and robust reviews, had not been proven.
- The Trust accepted and had progressed the improvement actions identified.
- The prolonged period of review and uncertainty had taken its toll on staff and staff morale; but the biggest impact had been on patients and families.

The Chair invited the Executive Board Member (Leeds City Council) to address the Joint Committee. A number of matters were raised, including:

- It had been 20 months since services at LTHT had been suspended and over 3 years since the national review.
- Questions remained about the timing of the suspension, following the overturning of the recommendations of the Safe and Sustainable review.
- Concern around 'unchecked allegations' being considered to be 'whistleblowing'.
- Concerns about the lack of appropriate involvement of or referral of allegations to Leeds Children's Safeguarding Boards, which had not formed part of the review commissioned by NHS England.

In considering the information presented and the representations provided at the meeting, members of the Joint Committee raised and discussed a number of matters, including:

- Disappointment about the non-attendance of Sir Bruce Keogh, who had been invited to attend the meeting.
- Disappointment about the length of time taken to complete and published the reports presented.
- The need for learning from LTHT's experience to feed into future NHS reviews – both in relation to cardiac surgery services and other specialist areas.
- Concern about actions taken based on unvalidated data.
- Assurance in relation to the improvement actions taken by LTHT and improved processes now in place.
- Concern that some of the issues and identified improvement actions had not solely related to LTHT.
- The need to rebuild trust, cooperation and collaboration across specialist Trusts delivering cardiac surgery services.
- Assurance sought in relation to the lessons learned by NHS England in terms of internal processes; the timeliness of commissioning reviews and publication of reports; and the general approach to safeguarding matters.

At 3:25pm, Councillor Wyatt left the meeting. The meeting became in-quorate and was immediately adjourned.

The Chair thanked all those present for their attendance.